arXiv:1211.6534v1 [gr-qc] 28 Nov 2012

Stability Analysis in N dimensional Gravitational collapse with equation of state

Sanjay Sarwe [a] [*] and R. V. Saraykar [b] [†]
[a] Department of Mathematics, S. F. S. College,
Seminary Hill, Nagpur-440 006, India
[b] Department of Mathematics, RTM Nagpur University Campus,
Nagpur-440 033, India

Abstract

We study stability of occurrence of black holes and naked singularities that arise as a final state for a complete gravitational collapse of type I matter field in a spherically symmetric N dimensional spacetime with equation of state $p = k\rho$, $0 \leq k \leq 1$. We prove that for a regular initial data comprising of pressure (or density) profiles at an initial surface $t = t_i$, from which the collapse evolves, there exists a large class of the velocity functions and classes of solutions of Einstein equations, such that the spacetime evolution goes to a final state which is either a black hole or a naked singularity. We further prove that in an infinite dimensional separable Banach space, the set of regular initial data leading the collapse to a black hole or a naked singularity, forms an open subset of the set of all regular initial data. In this sense, the gravitational collapse leading to either a black hole or a naked singularity is stable. These results are discussed and analyzed in the light of the cosmic censorship hypothesis in black hole physics.
Keywords: Type I matter field, gravitational collapse, central-singularity

1 Introduction

The arrival of Tolman's dust solutions [1] in 1934 to Einstein's field equations in spherically symmetric spacetime has led to investigation of nature of singularity in various models like dust, null dust, perfect fluid, quark matter etc. in later years. Considering Tolman solution, Oppenheimer and Snyder [2], in 1939, have studied the collapse of spherically symmetric homogeneous dust cloud, which led to the general concept of trapped surfaces and the black hole (BH). In 1951, Vaidya identified the general metric appropriate to a spherically symmetric distribution of null dust [3] and considering linear mass function, Papapetrou and Kurada [4] have shown that the central singularity will be a naked singularity and persistent, when the collapse is sufficiently slow. Hereafter, many numerical and theoretical studies were carried out in different models by various authors [5] presenting counter examples to Cosmic Censorship Cenjecture(CCC).

In a recent paper, R. Goswami and P. S. Joshi [6] pointed out that the occurrence of naked singularity(NS) as end state of dust collapse beginning from smooth initial data with physically relevant restrictions, can be removed when one goes to higher dimensional space-time. This has restored CCC in dust collapse for sufficiently higher dimension of the space-time. Many other cases of the dust collapse have been studied by various authors [7].

---

[*] Electronics address: sbsarwe@gmail.com
[†] Electronics address: ravindra.saraykar@gmail.com

Lot of importance is being given to the physically relevant models such as Type I matter fields that include most of the known physical forms of matter like dust, perfect fluid, etc. The authors in [8] have discussed the role of initial data in spherically symmetric gravitational collapse for Type I matter fields.

Joshi and Goswami have studied the case of an isentropic perfect fluid with linear equation of state in four dimensional spacetime, wherein, they pointed out that the occurrence of NS/BH evolving from regular initial data depends on the choice of rest of the free functions available [9], and also they have proved that in N dimensional dust collapse, the occurrence of NS can be removed when one goes to higher dimensional space-time, thus restoring CCC [10].

In recent years, special attention is given to higher dimensional gravitational collapse since the development in string theory indicate that gravity may be a higher dimensional interaction [11]. Hence, it would be interesting to know the status of CCC in higher dimensional spacetime. These studies may help in possible appropriate mathematical formulation of the conjecture or assist in providing any possible proof of CCC [12]. N. Dadhich et.al. have studied spherically symmetric collapse of fluid with non-vanishing radial pressure in higher dimensional space-time with equation of state $p_r = k\rho$ through construction of the root equation governing the nature (BH versus NS) of the central singularity [13].

However, all of the initial data is not independent, so it poses a question, which initial data set shall evolve into a NS as a result of gravitational collapse? Further, having a NS for certain initial data set is not enough because if it looses its characteristic for small perturbation in the neighbourhood of that data set then the NS is not serious enough to challenge cosmic censorship conjecture [14]. Therefore, the all important question is that, "is the NS developed from certain initial data set a stable one?". We study this behaviour of NS using definitions of stability and genericity following Abraham and Marsden [15, 16].

Introduction of equation of state has importance as it makes the collapsing models physically more relevant. Does the linear equation of state $p = k\rho$ stimulates the outcome of NS/BH phases as end state of gravitational collapse? We investigate this question through analysis of field equations of N-dimensional gravitational collapse with linear equation of state in section 2. The study of radial null geodesics in N dimensions is carried out in section 3. In section 4, we analyze the condition of existence of naked singularity to prove our assertion mentioned above by using existence theory of first order ordinary differential equations [17]. Thereafter, in section 5, we prove openness of initial data set and then we discuss genericity of this set in section 5.1

2 Collapse with linear equation of state

The general spherically symmetric metric describing N dimensional space-time geometry of a collapsing cloud can be described in comoving coordinates $(t, r, \theta^1, \theta^2, .., \theta^{N-2})$ by

$$ds^2 = -e^{2\nu(t,r)}dt^2 + e^{2\psi(t,r)}dr^2 + R^2(t,r)d\Omega^2_{N-2} \tag{1}$$

where

$$d\Omega^2_{N-2} = \sum_{i=1}^{N-2}\left[\prod_{j=1}^{i-1}\sin^2(\theta^j)\right]\,(d\theta^i)^2$$

is the metric on an $(N-2)$ sphere. The stress-energy tensor for Type I field in a diagonal form is given by [18]

$$T^t_t = -\rho,\ T^r_r = T^{\theta^i}_{\theta^i} = \ p\ \ . \tag{2}$$

The quantities ρ and p are the energy density and pressure respectively. We take the matter field to satisfy weak energy condition which implies $\rho\geq 0$; $\rho+p\geq 0$. Linear equation of state for perfect fluid is

$$p(t,r)=k\ \rho(t,r)\ \text{where}\ k\in[0,1]\ \ . \tag{3}$$

Einstein field equations for the metric (1) are derived as

$$\rho=\frac{(N-2)F'}{2R^{N-2}R'}\quad=-\frac{1}{k}\frac{(N-2)\dot{F}}{2R^{N-2}\dot{R}} \tag{4}$$

$$\nu'=-\frac{k}{k+1}[\ln(\rho)]' \tag{5}$$

$$R'\dot{G}-2\dot{R}G\ \nu'=0 \tag{6}$$

$$G-H=1-\frac{F}{R^{N-3}}\ \ . \tag{7}$$

where $F=F(t,r)$ is an arbitrary function, and has an interpretation of the mass function for the cloud. It gives the total mass in a shell of comoving radius r on any spacelike hypersurface $t=$ const. The energy conditions impose condition on F that $F(t,r)\geq 0$. In order to preserve the regularity at the initial epoch, we have $F(t_i,0)=0$, that is, the mass function should vanish at the center of the cloud. Since we are considering collapse, we have $\dot{R}<0$, i.e. the physical radius R of the collapsing cloud keeps decreasing in time and ultimately reaches $R=0$, which denotes the singularity where all matter shells collapse to a zero physical radius. The functions G and H are defined as $G(t,r)=e^{-2\psi}R'^2$ and $H(t,r)=e^{-2\nu}\dot{R}^2$.

Let us define a new function $v(t,r)$ by $v(t,r)=R/r$, and now we use the scaling independence of the comoving coordinate r to write

$$\begin{gathered}R(t,r)=r\ v(t,r)\\ \text{where}\ \ v(t_i,r)=1;\ \ v(t_s(r),r)=0;\ \ \dot{v}<0\end{gathered} \tag{8}$$

The time $t=t_s(r)$ corresponds to the shell-focusing singularity at $R=0$, where all the matter shells collapse to a vanishing physical radius. The introduction of the parameter v as above allows us to distinguish the spacetime singularity from the regular center, with $v=1$ at the initial epoch, including the center $r=0$, which then decreases monotonically with time as collapse progresses to value $v=0$ at the singularity $R=0$. At the regular center the mass function $F(t,r)$ behaves suitably so that the density remains finite and regular there at all times till the occurrence of singular epoch. A general mass function for the cloud can be considered as

$$F(t,r)=r^{N-1}M(r,v) \tag{9}$$

where $M(r,v)$ is regular and continuously twice differentiable. Using equation (9) in equation (4), we obtain

$$\rho=\frac{N-2}{2}\times\frac{(N-1)M+r[M_{,r}+M_{,v}\ v']}{v^{N-2}(v+rv')}\quad=-\frac{(N-2)M_{,v}}{2k\ v^{N-2}}\ \ . \tag{10}$$

Then as $v\rightarrow 0$, $\rho\rightarrow\infty$ and $p\rightarrow\infty$ i.e. both the density and pressure blow up at the singularity. At the initial epoch, the regular density distribution takes the form

$$\rho_o(r)=\frac{N-2}{2}[rM(r,1),_{\ r}+(N-1)M(r,1)]\ \ . \tag{11}$$

We rearrange equation (10) as follows

$$krM_{,\ r} + Z(r,v)M_{,\ v} = -(N-1)kM \tag{12}$$

where

$$Z(r,v) = (k+1)rv' + v\ \ . \tag{13}$$

Equation (12) has many classes of solutions but only those classes of solutions should be considered which satisfy energy conditions, which are regular and gives $\rho \to \infty$ as $v \to 0$. This means the energy conditions and equation of state $p = k\rho$ isolate the class of functions $M(r,v)$ so that the mass function $F(t,r)$, the metric function $\nu(t,r)$ and the function $\mathbf{b}(r)$ (to follow) evolve as the collapse begins according to the Type I field equations. The energy condition imposes constraint on $M(r,v)$ as $M_{,\ v} < 0$. Hence we set

$$M(0,v) = \frac{M_o}{v^{(N-1)k}} \tag{14}$$

where M_o is a positive constant, such that energy density $\rho \to \infty$ as $v \to 0$. On integrating equation (5), we obtain the general metric function,

$$\nu(r,v) = -l[\ln(\rho)]. \tag{15}$$

where $l = \frac{k}{k+1}$. Define a suitably differentiable function $A(r,v)$, $A(r,v)_{,\ v} = \nu'/R'$ so that equation (15) takes the form

$$A(r,v)_{\ ,\ v} = -\frac{l\rho'}{\rho R'}. \tag{16}$$

At the initial epoch, we have

$$[A(r,v)_{\ ,\ v}]_{v=1} = -\frac{l\ \rho_o'(r)}{\rho_o(r)} \tag{17}$$

whereas using equation (10), the relation between the function M and A, at all epochs is given by

$$A(r,v)_{\ ,\ v}\ R' = -l\left[\ \ln\left(-\frac{(N-2)M_{,v}}{2k\ v^{N-2}}\right)\right]'. \tag{18}$$

From above, it is clear that $M(r,v)$ is a decreasing function with respect to v and if we consider a smooth initial profile for the density in such way that density gradient vanishes at the center then we have $A(r,v) = rg_o(r,v)$ where $g_o(r,v)$ is another suitably differentiable function.

Also, the use of definition of $A(r,v)$ in equation (6) yields

$$G(t,r) = \mathbf{d}(r)\ e^{2rA} \tag{19}$$

where $\mathbf{d}(r)$ is another arbitrary continuously differentiable function of r. Following comparison with the dust model, we can write

$$\mathbf{d}(r) = 1 + r^2\ \mathbf{b}(r) \tag{20}$$

where $\mathbf{b}(r)$ is the energy distribution function for the collapsing shells. Define a function $\mathbf{h}(r,v)$ as

$$\mathbf{h}(r,v) = \frac{e^{2rA} - 1}{r^2} \tag{21}$$

and substituting this equation, together with (19) and (20) in equation (7), we get

$$v^{(N-3)/2}\ \dot{v} = -\rho^{-l}\sqrt{v^{N-3}\mathbf{h}(r,v) + \mathbf{b}v^{N-3}e^{2rA} + M} \tag{22}$$

where negative sign is chosen since, for the collapse, $\dot{v} < 0$. Integrating the above equation , we have

$$t(v,r) = \int_v^1 \frac{v^{(N-3)/2}dv}{\rho^{-l}\sqrt{v^{N-3}\mathbf{h}(r,v) + \mathbf{b}v^{N-3}e^{2rA} + M}} \quad . \tag{23}$$

In above equation, the variable r is treated as a constant. Expanding $t(v,r)$ around the center, we get

$$t(v,r) = t(v,0) + r\chi(v) + O(r^2) \tag{24}$$

where the function

$$\chi(v) = \frac{dt}{dr}\Big|_{r=0} = -\frac{1}{2}\int_v^1 \frac{v^{(N-3)/2}\mathcal{B}_{,r}(0,v)}{\mathcal{B}(0,v)^{3/2}}dv \tag{25}$$

and

$$\mathcal{B}(r,v) = \rho^{-2l}\left[v^{N-3}\mathbf{h}(r,v) + \mathbf{b}v^{N-3}e^{2rA} + M(r,v)\right] \quad . \tag{26}$$

The time when the central singularity develops is given by

$$t_{s_o} = \int_0^1 \frac{v^{(N-3)/2}dv}{\mathcal{B}(0,v)^{1/2}} \quad . \tag{27}$$

The time for other collapsing shells to reach the singularity can be expressed by

$$t_s(r) \equiv t(0,r) = t_{s_o} + r\chi(0) + O(r^2) \quad . \tag{28}$$

$$\text{where } \chi(0) = \lim_{v\to 0}\chi(v). \tag{29}$$

Now, it is clearly seen that the value of $\chi(0)$ depends on the free functions $\mathbf{b}(0), M(0,v)$ and $\mathbf{h}(0,v)$, which in turn, depend on the initial data at the initial surface $t = t_i$. Thus, a tangent to the singularity curve $t = t_s(r)$ is completely determined by the given set of density, pressure, velocity function ν and function $\mathbf{b}$. Further, from equation (22), on $v =$ const. surface, we can write

$$v^{(N-3)/2}v' = \chi(v)\mathcal{B}(0,v)^{1/2} + \mathcal{O}(r) \quad . \tag{30}$$

Let us analyze the nature of $\chi(0)$ from the point of view of equation (25). The existence of the limit depends on the cumulative effect of all the terms present in the equation but since $\mathcal{B}(0,v) > 0$ as $v \to 0$, provided $M(0,0) > 0$ and $v \in [0,1]$, therefore positive or negative sign of $\chi(0)$ absolutely depends on the sign of $\mathcal{B}_{,r}(0,v)$.

Now, $\mathcal{B}(0,v) > 0$ and if

$$\mathcal{B}_{,r}(0,v) = -\frac{2\,l\rho'(0,t)\mathcal{B}(0,v)}{\rho} + \rho^{-2l}\left[v^{N-3}(h_{,r}(0,v) + \mathbf{b}'(0)) + M_{,r}(0,v)\right] < 0$$

then integrand in equation (25) is positive and hence, $\chi(0) > 0$. This is possible, since density is very high in the neighbourhood of the singularity and it decreases as r increases from $r = 0$, therefore, $\rho'(0,t)$ should be negative to be physically reasonable and hence sign of $\mathcal{B}_{,r}(0,v)$ depends on the sign of $\left[v^{N-3}[\mathbf{h}_{,r}(0,v) + \mathbf{b}'(0)] + M_{,r}(0,v)\right]$ i.e. depends solely on the initial data. The introduction of an equation of state has ensured that the system of Einstein equations is closed and so freedom to specify any function is exhausted. Therefore, the functions $\mathbf{h}(r,v)$ be written in terms of $\mathbf{b}(r)$ and $M(r,v)$. Hence, the choice of class of functions $\mathbf{b}(r)$ and $M(r,v)$ shall decide the final fate of gravitational collapse. So, the occurrence of NS or BH phases exist, depending on the choice of the class of function $M(r,v)$.

3 Radial null geodesics

Now, we investigate below when there will be families of null geodesics emanating, which will be future directed and outgoing, and which terminate in the past at the singularity, thus making the communication from the singularity to an outside observer possible, as opposed to a black hole situation. Hence, for examination of the nature of central singularity at $R = 0, r = 0$, we consider the equation of outgoing radial null geodesics, given by,

$$\frac{dt}{dr} = e^{\psi - \nu}.$$

Further, we write the null geodesic equation in terms of the variables ($u = r^{\beta}, R$), choosing $\beta = \frac{1}{1-k}[\frac{(N+1)}{(N-1)} - k]$, and using equation (7), we have

$$\frac{dR}{du} = \frac{1}{\beta}\left(\frac{R}{u} + \frac{v' v^{\frac{(N-3)-(N-1)k}{2}}}{(\frac{R}{u})^{\frac{[(N-3)-(N-1)k]}{2}}}\right)\left(\frac{1 - \frac{F}{R^{N-3}}}{\sqrt{G}[\sqrt{G} + \sqrt{H}]}\right) \tag{31}$$

If the null geodesics terminate at the singularity in the past with a definite tangent, then at the singularity, we have $dR/du > 0$, in the (u, R) plane with a finite value. All other points $r > 0$ on the singularity curve are covered since $F/R^{N-3} \to \infty$ with $dR/du \to -\infty$ and only the singularity at the centre $r = 0$ could be naked. For the case, when $R' > 0$ near the central singularity, we have

$$x_o = \lim_{t \to t_s} \lim_{r \to o} \frac{R}{u} = \left.\frac{dR}{du}\right|_{t \to t_s, r \to o} \tag{32}$$

and use of equation (30) for v', equation (31) yield

$$x_o^{\frac{(N-1)(1-k)}{2}} = \frac{(1-k)(N-1)}{2}\sqrt{M_o}\left(\frac{2}{M_o(N-1)(N-2)}\right)^{\frac{k}{k+1}} \chi(0)$$

and the radial null geodesic emerging from the singularity in (R, u) co-ordinates is $R = x_o u$, or in (t, r) plane, it is given by

$$t - t_s(0) = x_o \, r^{\beta} \, .$$

Therefore, $x_o > 0$ iff $\chi(0) > 0$, and hence $\chi(0) > 0$ is a sufficient condition for the occurrence of the NS at the center of the cloud as the end state of gravitational collapse of a sufficiently dense star when it loses its equilibrium state, and continual collapse begins with regular initial data of density and pressure profiles $p = k\rho$. There will be radially future outgoing null geodesics emanating from the singularity, giving rise to a locally NS at the center. However, if $\chi(0) < 0$ then we have a black hole solution, as there will be no such trajectories coming out. Also, it is observed from above equation that parameter k (because $(1-k) > 0$) and dimensionality N do not take part in the decision making of the sign of $\chi(0)$. Thus the final fate of collapse of a massive star leads to either a BH or a NS with appropriate choice of initial data for $N \geq 4$. For $\chi(0) = 0$, we will have to take into account the next higher order non-zero term in the singularity curve equation, and a similar analysis can be carried out by choosing a different value of β.

4 Existence of function b(r) leading to NS

In this section, we prove the assertion mentioned in the introduction. We choose $b(r)$ to satisfy the differential equation on a constant v-surface

$$\frac{1}{2}\frac{v^{(N-3)/2}\mathcal{B}_{,r}(r,v)}{\mathcal{B}(r,v)^{3/2}} = B(r,v) \tag{33}$$

for $0 \leq r \leq r_c$ where $B(r,v)$ is a continuous function defined on $\mathcal{D}$ such that $B(0,v) < 0$ for all v in $[0,1]$. It will then follow that

$$\chi(0) = \lim_{v \to 0} \chi(v) = -\int_0^1 B(0,v) dv > 0. \tag{34}$$

This condition ensures that central shell-focusing singularity will be naked.

We, now, discuss the existence of $\mathbf{b}(r)$ as a solution of the differential equation (33). We put

$$x(r,v) = \rho^{-2\,l} \left[v^{N-3}\mathbf{h}(r,v) + \mathbf{b}v^{N-3}(1 + r^2\mathbf{h}(r,v)) + M(r,v) \right] \tag{35}$$

a continuous function of r, in equation (33) and rearranging it, we get

$$\frac{dx}{dr} = \frac{1}{v^{(N-3)/2}} \left[2B(r,v)x^{3/2} \right] \equiv f(x,r) \tag{36}$$

with the initial condition

$$x(0,v) = \rho(0,v)^{-2\,l} \left[v^{N-3}\mathbf{h}(0,v) + \mathbf{b}(0)v^{N-3} + M(0,v) \right]. \tag{37}$$

Let us ensure the existence of C^1 - function $x(r,v)$ as a solution of above initial value problem defined throughout the cloud. The function $f(x,r)$ is continuous in r, with x restricted to a bounded domain. With such domain of r and x, $f(x,r)$ is also C^1 - function in x which means $f(x,r)$ is Lipschitz continuous in x. Therefore, the differential equation (36) has a unique solution satisfying initial condition (37).

Further, we can ensure that the solution will be defined over the entire cloud i.e. for all r in $[0,r_c]$ by using the freedom in the choice of arbitrary function $B(r,v)$. For this , we consider the domain $[0,r_c] \times [0,d]$ for some finite d. Let S be the supremum of the modulus of $f(x,r)$. Then the differential equation (36) has a unique solution defined over the entire cloud provided [17]

$$r_c \leq \inf(r_c, \frac{d}{S}) = \frac{d}{S}. \tag{38}$$

This yields

$$\max_{0 \leq r \leq r_c, 0 \leq x \leq d} \left| \frac{1}{v^{(N-3)/2}} \left[2B(r,v)x^{3/2} \right] \right| \leq \frac{d}{r_c}. \tag{39}$$

Condition (38), in turn, will be satisfied if the weaker condition

$$0 \leq |B(r,v)|\; x^{3/2} \leq \frac{d\; v^{(N-3)/2}}{2\; r_c} \tag{40}$$

holds for all r in $[0,r_c]$.

The collapsing cloud may start with r_c small enough so that the expression $d\; v^{(N-3)/2}/2\; r_c$ which is always positive, satisfies the condition (40) with x restricted to a bounded domain. We then have infinitely many choices for the function $B(r,v)$, which is continuous and satisfies conditions (40) and $B(0,v) < 0$ for each choice of v. For each such $B(r,v)$, there will be a unique solution $x(r,v)$ of the differential equation (36), satisfying initial condition (37), defined over the entire cloud and in turn, there exist a unique function $\mathbf{b}(r)$ for each such choice of $B(r,v)$, that is given by the expression

$$\mathbf{b}(r) = \frac{1}{v^{N-3}(1 + r^2\mathbf{h}(r,v))} \times$$
$$\left[x(r,v) \left(\frac{N-2}{2} \right)^{2\,l} \left(\frac{(N-1)M + r(M_{,r} + M_{,v}v')}{v^{N-2}(v + rv')} \right)^{2\,l} - v^{N-3}\mathbf{h}(r,v) - M(r,v) \right]$$

over $[0, r_c]$. Thus, for a given constant v-surface and given initial data of mass function $F(t, r) = r^{N-1}M(r, v)$ and $\mathbf{h}(r, v) = (e^{r^2 g_2(r,v)} - 1)/r^2$ satisfying physically reasonable conditions (expressed on M), there exists infinitely many choices for the function $\mathbf{b}(r)$ such that condition $B(0, v) < 0$ is satisfied. The condition continues to hold as $v \to 0$, because of continuity. Hence, the central singularity developed in the collapse is a naked singularity.

5 Stability of Naked Singularity

The analysis in section 2 shows that the only conditions on the initial data which evolves the collapse into a naked singularity are the energy conditions. Hence, for stability, we have to examine energy conditions only. What we now show is that, the set of such initial data satisfying energy conditions forms an open subset of the space of all initial data. For this , we use the technique of Saraykar and Ghate [20]. The energy conditions are $\rho \geq 0$ and $\rho + p \geq 0$ but since $p = k\rho$, $\rho \geq 0$ is the only sufficient condition required in this set up and can be written in the form

$$\left[(N-1)M + rM_{,r} + rv'M_{,v}\right] \equiv E_1 \geq 0,$$

on the domain $\mathcal{D}$. Here, we have used an assumption that v is an increasing function of r so that $v' \geq 0$ on any surface $t = t_j$ say, so that no shell-crossing singularity condition ($ie.R' > 0$) holds. So, this is a valid assumption.

We assume that X be an infinite dimensional Banach space of all C^1 real-valued functions defined on $\mathcal{D}$, endowed with the norms

$$\parallel M(r, v) \parallel = \sup_{\mathcal{D}} |M| + \sup_{\mathcal{D}} |M_{,r}| + \sup_{\mathcal{D}} |M_{,v}|$$

These norms are equivalent to the standard C^1 norm

$$\parallel M(r, v) \parallel = \sup_{\mathcal{D}}(|M| + |M_{,r}| + |M_{,v}|) \tag{41}$$

Let $\mathcal{G} = \{M(r, v) : M > 0, M \text{ is } C^1, \ E_1 > 0 \text{ on } \mathcal{D}\}$ be a subset of X.

We show that $\mathcal{G}$ is an open subset of X. For M in $\mathcal{G}$, let us put $\delta = \min(M)$, $\gamma = \min(E_1)$, and $\lambda_3 = \max(v')$ for varying r in $[0, r_c]$ and $v \,\epsilon [0, 1]$, the functions involved herein are all continuous functions defined on a compact domain $\mathcal{D}$ and hence, their maxima and minima exist. We define a positive real number

$$\mu = \frac{1}{2}\min\{\delta, \frac{\gamma}{3(N-1)}, \frac{\gamma}{3r_c}, \frac{\gamma}{3r_c\lambda_3}\}.$$

Let $M_1(r, v)$ be C^1 in $\mathcal{D}$ with $\parallel M - M_1 \parallel < \mu$. Using definition (41), we get $|M_1 - M| < \mu$, $|M_{1,r} - M_{,r}| < \mu$ and $|M_{1,v} - M_{,v}| < \mu$ over $\mathcal{D}$. Therefore, for choice of μ, the respective inequalities are

$$M_1 > M - \frac{\delta}{2} > 0, \tag{42}$$

$$(N-1)|M_1 - M| < \frac{\gamma}{6}, \tag{43}$$

$$r|M_{1,r} - M_{,r}| \leq r_c|M_{1,r} - M_{,r}| < \frac{\gamma}{6}, \tag{44}$$

$$rv'|M_{1,v} - M_{,v}| \leq r_c\lambda_3|M_{1,v} - M_{,v}| < \frac{\gamma}{6}, \tag{45}$$

that are satisfied on $\mathcal{D}$. Combining inequations (43,44,45) from above, we have

$$(N-1)|M_1 - M| + r|M_{1,r} - M_{,r}| + rv'|M_{1,v} - M_{,v}| < \frac{\gamma}{2} < \gamma \leq E_1$$

Therefore, $|\,[(N-1)M_1 + rM_{1,r} + rv'M_{1,v}] - E_1\,| < E_1$ where $E_1 > 0$ on $\mathcal{D}$.
Hence, $[(N-1)M_1 + rM_{1,r} + rv'M_{1,v}] > 0$ on $\mathcal{D}$.

Thus, $M_1 > 0$, M_1 is C^1 and $[(N-1)M_1 + rM_{1,r} + rv'M_{1,v}] > 0$ throughout $\mathcal{D}$. Therefore, $M_1(r,v)$ also lies in $\mathcal{G}$ and hence, $\mathcal{G}$ is an open subset of X. Now, let Y be an infinite dimensional Banach space of all C^1 real-valued functions defined on $\mathcal{D}$. The set $\mathcal{H}$ of functions $\mathbf{h}(r,v)$ would form (by similar technique) an open subset of Y. Then $\mathcal{G} \times \mathcal{H}$ is an open subset in the product space $X \times Y$.

Taking $(M_1, \mathbf{h}_1(r,v))$ in the neighbourhood of $(M, \mathbf{h}(r,v))$ in $G \times \mathcal{H}$, and using equation (40) analogously for M_1 and $\mathbf{h}_1$, we have a choice of infinitely many $B_1(r,v)$, such that for each such $B_1(r,v)$, there will exist a unique $\mathbf{b}_1(r)$ so that the initial data of mass function $r^3 M_1$ and $\mathbf{h}_1(r,v)$ together will lead the collapse to formation of a naked singularity. Thus, naked singularity arising from $(M, \mathbf{h}(r,v))$ is C^1 - stable in the sense defined above but since in earlier analysis the initial data functions are at least C^2, therefore NS arising from initial data is C^2-stable.

The analysis given above, guarantee the existence of a metric function $\nu(t,r)$ for a given initial data set. Such choice of $\nu(t,r)$ and expressions for G and H together will yield the metric (1) as an exact solution leading to the occurrence of naked singularity. Thus, given initial data and the weak energy conditions above determine the matter distribution and the metric of the space-time.

5.1 Issue of Genericity of Black Holes and Naked Singularities

We have seen that in Type I matter field collapse, the end state of collapse is governed by the choice of initial data. We have also shown that the set of initial data leading the collapse to a naked singularity or a black hole forms an open subset of the full set of initial data, and thus both the occurrences are stable.

It is also clear that these sets as subsets of initial data set leading the collapse to BH and NS are mutually disjoint. Since both of them are open, none of them can be dense in $X \times Y$. Thus, in the strict Mathematical sense [15, 16], both these occurrences are not generic.

Nevertheless, each of these sets are substantially big sets. Following the measure theoretic analysis on infinite dimensional spaces given in Section IV of [21], it can be argued that these sets have a non-zero measure.

6 Conclusions

Our main conclusions are as follows:
1(a). Given a C^2- mass function $M(r,v)$ and a C^1- function $\mathbf{h}(r,v)$, on any $v =$ constant surface, we find a C^1- energy distribution function $\mathbf{b}(r)$ such that the collapse ends in a naked singularity.
1(b). With physically reasonable conditions put on mass function M, and with C^1- function $\mathbf{h}(r,v)$, the initial data consisting of $(M, \mathbf{h}(r,v))$ leading the collapse to a naked singularity forms an open subset of the space $X \times Y$. This establishes stability of naked singularity with respect to initial data.
2. Similar analysis for the case $\chi(0) < 0$ (that is $B(0,v) > 0$ for all v in $[0,1]$) shows that the occurrence of black hole is stable but not generic. Thus, both the occurrences , namely, black holes and naked singularities, are stable but not generic.

3. Also, it is found that equation of state parameter k and dimensionality N of spacetime do not take part in the decision making of the sign of $\chi(0)$. So for critical value $\chi(0) > 0$, a spectrum of radial null geodesics can emanate from the central singularity but many of them may fall back to the singularity. Further, it can be investigated whether k and N assist in making a locally NS to be a globally NS which can be seen by a faraway observer.

References

[1] R. C. Tolman, Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci., **20**, 169 (1934).

[2] J. R. Oppenheimer and H. Snyder, Phys. Rev. **56**, 455 (1939).

[3] P. C. Vaidya, Proc. of the Indian Acad. Sci. **A33**, 264 (1951).

[4] A. Papapetrou, *'Formation of a Singularity and causality', in 'A Random Walk in Relativity and Cosmology'*, Wiley Eastern, New Delhi. (1985). Y. Kuroda, Prog. Theor. Phys. **72**, 63 (1984).

[5] D. M. Eardley and L. Smarr, Phys. Rev. **D19**, 2239 (1979). D. Christoudolou, Comm. Math. Phys. **93**, 171 (1984). A. Ori and T. Piran, Phys. Rev. D **42**, 1068 (1990).

[6] R. Goswami and P. S. Joshi, Phys. Rev. **D69**, 104002, (2004)

[7] S. G. Ghosh and A. Beesham, Phys. Rev. D **64**, 124005 (2001). A. Banerjee, U. Debnath, S. Chakraborty, gr-qc/0211099. K. D. Patil, S. H. Ghate and R. V. Saraykar, Ind. Jour. of Pure and App. Maths., **33**, 379 (2002).

[8] P. S. Joshi and I. H. Dwivedi, Class. Quantum Grav. **16** (1999) 41-59. P. S. Joshi, Pramana-J. Phys. **55**(2000) 529-544, gr-qc/0006101. P. S. Joshi and R. Goswami, Physical Review D **69**, 064027 (2004)

[9] P. S. Joshi and R. Goswami, Class. Quantum Grav **21**, 3645 (2004).

[10] P. S. Joshi, *Singularities, black holes and cosmic censorship*, IUCAA Publications, Pune (1997).

[11] L. Randall and R. Sundram, Phys. Rev. Lett. **83**, 3370 (1999); Phys. Rev. Lett. **83**, 4690 (1999).

[12] T. Kaluza, Sitz Preuss. Akad. Wiss. **D 33**, 966 (1921); O. Klein, Z. Phys., 895 (1926). S. B. Sarwe and R. V. Saraykar, Grav. & Cosmology, Vol. **10** (2004), No. 4(40), pp. 329-334. S. G. Ghosh, S. B. Sarwe and R. V. Saraykar, Phys. Rev. D **66**, 084006 (2002).

[13] N. Dadhich, S. G. Ghosh and D. W. Deshkar Int. J. Mod. Phys. A **20**, 1495-1502 (2005).

[14] R. Penrose, Riv. Nuovo Cimento **1**, 252 (1969); in *General Relativity, an Einstein Centenary Volume*, edited by S. W. Hawking and W. Israel (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, England, 1979).

[15] R. Abraham and J. Marsden, *Foundations of Mechanics*, 2nd edition (The Benjamin/Cummings Publishing Company, Menlo park, CA, 1978).

[16] S. B. Sarwe and R. V. Saraykar, Pramana, J. Phys. vol. **65**, No. 1,July 2005, pp 17-33.

[17] F. Verhulst, *Non-linear Differential Equations and Dynamical Systems* (Berlin: Springer, 1989)

[18] S. W. Hawking and G. F. R. Ellis, *The Large Scale Structure of Space-time* (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1973).

[19] R. Goswami and P. S. Joshi, Phys.Rev. **D76**,084026 (2007)

[20] R. V. Saraykar and S. H. Ghate, Class. Quantum Grav. **16** (1999) 281-289.

[21] P. S. Joshi, Daniele Malafarina and R. V. Saraykar, Int. J. Mod. Phys. D **21**,No. 8 (2012), 12500036 (38 pages).